

## ***BIDDULPH TRAIL SUBDIVISION: BUTTERNUT RIDGE ROAD***

### **THE FOLLOWING IS AN EXCERPT OF THE PLANNING & DESIGN COMMISSION MINUTES DATED NOVEMBER 28, 2007**

#### **COMS07-0026: Biddulph Trail; 25747 Butternut Ridge Road: (Ward 4)**

Representatives: Tom Liggett, architect; Peggy Brown, landscape architect; Peter Zwick, civil engineer; Ron DeLorenzo, owner

The proposal consists of a new cluster home development and rezoning the parcel to Residential Cluster. Ms. Wenger reviewed that there would be 29 cluster homes on a 10+ acre parcel located east of Springvale Golf Course on Butternut Ridge Road. The property is currently zoned Single Residence. The proposal involves rezoning the parcels to Residential Cluster District. She referenced sections of the 2005 Master Plan pertaining to parcels such as this which are deep but do not have lot frontage. She also reviewed the new Residential Cluster District which reduced density from single family cluster, requires higher percentage of open space preservation, promotes more diversity in housing styles and arrangements and provides relief from subdivision regulations as a private development.

The proposed development plan conforms to all the requirements of the Residential Cluster District, with one exception. All units are required to be 15 feet from any open space or setback and units 1 and 2 do not meet that setback requirement. However the Commission has the ability to allow flexibility from the provision under 1136.07d. In addition to quantitative standards, the code provides guidance on more qualitative issues, which are listed as development standards including site design, building design, landscaping, vehicle circulation, pedestrian circulation, and open space. Overall she felt the proposal incorporated both the code requirements and development standards in a quality plan, especially given the challenging shape of the lot.

She noted that the homeowner's association documents would need to be reviewed and approved by the Law Department. Furthermore as a portion of the parcel is located within the Butternut Ridge Historic District, the proposal should be forwarded to the Landmarks Commission for review and issuance of a certificate of appropriateness for any changes which occur to the historic area of the parcel. Mr. Lasko questioned what historical significance the site had in the commissions review. Mr. O'Malley reviewed although the review would be separate the commission could take into consideration the historical character of the district. Mr. Conway advised that the Commission would determine the adequacy of the proposed open space.

Mr. Collins requested a wetlands determination. Storm water calculations meet city codes. An easement plat to the city and county for the water main and sanitary sewer is required. A traffic study shows less than 20 cars per hour but traffic traveling west bound on Butternut turning into the site could backup traffic. Therefore he recommends looking into a turning lane. To the east of the site there is water run off but the development of the site will improve the drainage of the area as there is a catch basin on every lot and a swale along the back.

Mr. O'Malley said the association's agreement and bylaw documents were required by code. As there is rezoning involved the commission has a more flexible authority for reviewing the development plan. The commission has sixty days in which to submit an official report to council relative to the performance standards. The sixty days started the first time the applicant was docketed to go before the

## ***BIDDULPH TRAIL SUBDIVISION: BUTTERNUT RIDGE ROAD***

commission however the applicant can extend the review time or the commission can request council extend the time for review.

Mr. Liggett said the parcel is a very narrow lot, with a 300 foot width at its widest point narrowing towards the front which is on Butternut Ridge Road. There is a private street which will have a 50 foot right of way with homes staggered along either side of the street. The first two units need approval to have a reduced setback. However as the homes abut the golf course, they believe it is an appropriate setback. Springvale Golf Course is to the south as well as the ravine which steps down about 20 to 30 feet. The ravine has a creek which includes a riparian setback which will not be altered. There is a 20 foot setback around the entire property except along Butternut Ridge it will have a 40 foot setback. Each unit is required to have a 15 foot rear setback and a 20 foot setback to the street. The site will fit 29 units and there will be three home style choices. He reviewed the various styles and floor plans. The color palette and style of the homes mimics an existing home to the west of the site. They will have siding, slate looking roofs and accent culture stones in buff and gray colors. A 4-inch beveled siding will be used along the first floors and the second stories have accented areas of shingle siding. All siding will be white and shingles will be a driftwood color and will appear to look like slate. There is a mailbox area which include guest parking and has a pull off. Along the ravine there will be a walking trail from the cul-de-sac to the hill-side in mulch.

Ms. Brown reviewed that the tree preservation plan submitted showed a diverse tree growth pattern. Along the front entrance there is a very large oak tree which they designed the entrance around to save. There are numerous varieties of trees throughout the site which will be saved including crabapples, black-cherry, ash, sassafras, elm, red-maple, sugar-maple, silver-maple, Norway spruce, and additional oaks. They tried to maintain as much vegetation along the golf course line as possible. Trees being removed will be replaced with more desirable trees such as black-gums which are prevalent along the westside. The front entrance will have entrance columns, a rustic gazebo in the front and a natural split-rail fence. The entrance column will include a small development sign. Along the front west property line the plantings were pulled inward onto their own property to provide the neighbor additional buffering. Along the eastside plantings include trees with seasonal plantings and ornamental grasses. The retention pond will be fenced and include variety plantings along the ponds edge to provide color including yellow iris and different varieties of flowers and dawn-redwoods to absorb the water in the area. The minimal street lights used on the site will be historical in nature with full cut-offs. Mr. Zwick reviewed that the last four sheets of the plans submitted comply with all the city code. He will direct their traffic expert to address a possible left-hand turning lane.

Mr. Lasko asked to know more about the home to be demolished. Mr. Liggett said that the home to be removed was originally the barn for the farm home down the street. There have been many additions and alterations from the original version of the barn. The two car garage and rooms along the backside are additions. There have been enough changes and modernized updates that the historic nature no longer exists. However using the character of the existing homes of the area in their development preserves the look of the historic district.

Mr. Lasko reviewed that the development as related to the standards listed in the code, including the existing ravine and many existing trees are being preserved, a variety of home styles is offered, the cluster development allows greater utilization of the open space and the area is consistent with the city master plan. Areas for utilization of public facilities and transportation needs still need to be addressed

## ***BIDDULPH TRAIL SUBDIVISION: BUTTERNUT RIDGE ROAD***

however. He questioned if a single family subdivision could be constructed on the site. Mr. Conway advised that it would be difficult to impossible to develop the lot as a residential subdivision. Mr. Lasko reviewed with staff that the proposed development plan met all other quantitative requirements of Chapter 1136.

Mr. Malone said the overall landscape and tree preservation plan is outstanding and has no recommendations or objections to the plans as submitted. The tree preservation plan outlines how the trees to be preserved will be protected during construction which he believed to be commendable. He considered mounding for buffering neighboring property but due to the varied elevations mounds could create drainage issues. The overall plan of development of the site as a cluster development is what was envisioned when the code was written and the site is an appropriate location for the development.

Mr. Rerko the development plan is a good plan, the homes are prepared well and the entrance fits the neighborhood. The estate style entrance works well to the development. However an area has a break in the landscaping along the south backyards which should have more landscaping to block headlights. Overall the development plan is a well thought-out plan.

Mr. Bohlmann questioned the impact on the Butternut Ridge Road traffic which is already heavy and asked if turning lanes would be feasible. Mr. Zwick advised that the traffic trip report showed that as the traffic impact was minimal turning lanes were not required. However he would have the traffic specialist address the possibility of turning lanes. Mr. Bohlmann said the overall development plan is a very well thought out detailed plan but there are existing traffic issues along Butternut Ridge Road now and he is concerned the development might be better off with an entrance from Great Northern Blvd.

Mr. Mahoney voiced that he agreed with other members and felt a traffic study was warranted and would assist the development. Mr. Rerko advised that if a traffic study showed turning lanes needed the plan would need to reflect the changes. Mr. O'Malley advised that due to the rezoning of the site the commission can ask that existing traffic be taken into consideration when conducting the traffic study. Mr. Lasko questioned if the site's access apron radius impeded the east neighbors driveway. Mr. Zwick said the city requested the apron be developed as shown but they will look at adjusting the apron.

Mr. Martindale reviewed the length of time he and his wife resided in their North Olmsted home and the age of the home. He reviewed that throughout the time he had lived on Butternut Ridge Road he has witnessed the city continuously breaking their promises that the historical district would be preserved. The district now has Moen Headquarters, apartments by the cemetery, I-480 and 252. Now the city is jamming a development in the district and spot zoning the site to make it fit. He said the owner of the site was already voted down once for this type of development and it should be voted down again. Mr. Mierzejewski said that the development wrapped around the back side of his property. He is concerned that the retention basin will create flooding and erosion problems. The culvert under Columbia Road is already eroding at the headwall which the city is dealing with any additional water into the creek will affect his lot. He questioned how the residents of the proposed site would be kept of their abutting lands. The city code regarding open space calculations, to meet open space areas such as the creek and ravine can not be considered as greenspace. He also did not feel the front open green space should be counted as a home could not be built in the space. Mr. Lasko read aloud a letter from Mr. Childs requesting the development be denied. The letter from Paula (Childs) Ziebarth, P.E. voiced her concerns the land use proposed and concerned with drainage of the site and believes rezoning the site would be a detriment to the city. They request the land if developed be developed as currently zoned.

## ***BIDDULPH TRAIL SUBDIVISION: BUTTERNUT RIDGE ROAD***

Mr. Gorris reviewed his time with the planning commission in 1991 when cluster family units were first introduced. He questioned what the city would get out of the development and thought it should be developed as a single family home. Mr. Sharp a 30 year resident of Butternut felt that some of the commissioners were for the development without hearing from the residents. They have worked hard keeping the commercial development from reaching south of I-480. The development will increase the already busy traffic and the residents will lose their front yards if the lanes are enlarged. If the commission is going to spot zone then just rezone the entire street so everyone can sell to developers. Ms. Toth voiced a concern that her driveway was being intersected by the entrance to the development. She questioned if there isn't a setback from her property that the site would need to maintain. She requested assurances that during construction there would be no vehicles parked along the side of her home as well as assurances that no lot would be left vacant prior to receiving final approval to ensure the land is not cleared and left vacant. Ms. Mullin said she moved into the historic district as she believed that it would remain historic and believed that her property lines as shown were not accurate.

Mr. O'Malley advised he would research the distance required for the street entrance. Mr. Steed said the sanitary sewers were not addressed much and south of the creek the homes are on septic tanks. The County has a moratorium that after January owners can no longer install septic systems in new homes so how can the development include septic systems. He questioned if the master plan addressed the homes along 252 receiving sanitary sewer lines. The city should take the opportunity to run the sanitary sewer lines south of the development along the golf course. Mr. Champa passed out a drawing and said that the two lines from the creek are supposed to run the water under the sewer line to the catch basin but it is really flowing into the surrounding ground and eroding the soil throughout the area as it seeps through the sandstone wall. The sanitary is surcharging and under pressure which he believes a 100 foot section of the line is only 1 ½ feet from the grade surface so there is not enough soil supporting it. Adding 29 homes to the already taxed system the sewer line will surely fail and the city needs to ensure that the development will not have a catastrophic affect on the overtaxed system. Councilman Orłowski said the city should have someone look at the integrity of the sanitary and storm lines. The system as shown including the retention pond seems to be at grade level and will not be able to be maintained on the property. He believed a study of the property should be conducted as well as a more detailed traffic study. Mr. Crabs said when the master plan was first worked on they were assured that it would protect the residents from spot zoning which is illegal. The sanitary line will collapse if the 29 additional homes are added as it is the sandstone walls are leaking now and the sanitary lines were laid above ground and there needs to be a curb installed to stop the water as well as a fence. He submitted a picture of a fence which he would like installed. Mr. Wiles reviewed that his home is over 100 years old the residents of the district ask the city to take the comments into consideration when the development is reviewed.

**Mr. Lasko moved, seconded by Mr. Mahoney, to table COMS07-0026: Biddulph Trail of 25747 Butternut Ridge Road which consists of a new cluster home development. The Commission requests that a report from the engineer regarding the storm and sanitary lines and easements be submitted, as well as information/impact on the septic and sanitary lines down Columbia Road. A detailed traffic study is required. The plan is to return within the 60 day time constraint or the applicant or council will be called upon to extend the review period which was unanimously approved.**

Mr. Lasko advised that the development would be heard by the Landmarks Commission on Monday, December 10, 2007 at 7:00 pm and no further notices would be given.